

PSYCHOLOGICAL DISTRESS AMONG HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS INVOLVED IN THE COVID-19 EMERGENCY: VULNERABILITY AND RESILIENCE FACTORS

Ciro Conversano, Laura Marchi, Mario Miniati

Abstract

The aim of this paper is to outline some considerations about the psychological distress in healthcare professional during the Covid-19 pandemic. We summarize available literature both on 'protective' and 'predisposing' factors potentially involved in the occurrence of psychological distress, including PTSD, in frontline healthcare operators. Valid social support, self-efficacy, internal locus of control (LOC) and sense of coherence (SOC) have been considered as resilience factors, in previous studies. Likewise, several observations pointed on the relevance of individual and environmental vulnerabilities. No real evidence is available about strategies to face the emotional burden for healthcare operators due to present COVID-19 scenario. However, we strongly believe that the containment of isolation anxiety with an appropriate emotional support should be the first instrument to minimise the psychological effect of pandemic on the more exposed healthcare professionals.

Key words: COVID-19, resilience, vulnerability, PTSD, healthcare professionals

Ciro Conversano¹, Ph.D., ciro.conversano@unipi.it
 Laura Marchi¹, laura.marchi83@gmail.com
 Mario Miniati², M.D., Ph.D., mario.miniati@med.unipi.it

¹ Department of Surgical, Medical and Molecular Pathology, Critical and Care Medicine, University of Pisa, Italy.

² Department of Clinical and Experimental Medicine, University of Pisa, Italy

The World Health Organization (WHO) defined the new 2019 coronavirus (COVID-19) as 'pandemic' on 11th March 2020. Apparently, three months before, no one knew that SARS-CoV-2 even existed. Governments declared healthcare emergencies with delay. Present scenario occurred, with a virus spreading to almost every country, thousands of deaths, a deep impact on economies, and a global challenge for the health-care systems. COVID-19 is pushing to frontline healthcare operators, causing an additional level of stress never faced before, even if paramedic and emergency personnel are accustomed to encounter events that may threaten their own wellbeing during daily work (Iranmanesh, Targari, & Bardsiri, 2013), including contacts with traumatized victims ('vicarious traumatization') (Greinacher, Derezza-Greeven, Herzog, & Nikendei 2019). Research already highlighted the higher prevalence of PTSD symptoms in emergency professionals than in general population samples (Carmassi et al., 2018; Carmassi et al., 2016). However, healthcare professionals are now experiencing new and unexpected fears, because of the specific characteristics of pandemic, namely the high transmissibility of the virus, the absence of vaccines and treatments, the sudden risk of transition to severe acute respiratory distress syndromes (ARDS), and the inadequate supply of personal protective equipment (PPE), as occurring in many countries. Moreover, COVID-19 has prompted the reorganization of entire hospitals' activities in about three weeks: elective activities have been interrupted, and intensive cares

freed up to create as many beds as possible. Indeed, there are enough factors raising the risks of developing a psychological distress on healthcare operators and professionals.

Due to the recent onset of pandemic, both epidemiological and clinical data on the occurrence of psychological distress, including PTSD, in COVID-19 healthcare professionals are lacking. However, we could infer both psychological vulnerability and resilience factors in response to COVID-19, from previous observations on healthcare professionals involved in a number of conditions of emergency and stress partially similar to the one of COVID-19, even if the coronavirus pandemic remain unheard-of. For example, several studies showed a high prevalence of PTSD symptoms, anxiety, fear, depression and frustration in emergency professionals involved in the SARS epidemic of 2002-2004 (Wei, Han, Liu, Liu, & Huan, 2004; Wu et al., 2009). The most common symptoms included recurrent and intrusive thoughts about the events experienced during patients care giving, difficulty in falling asleep, in memory and concentration, hyper-vigilance and hyper-arousal, anger outburst, loss of motivation to work, mood dysregulations, avoidance of working activities and places, alcohol/drugs abuse, numbing, isolation and psychological detachment (Pacella, Hruska, & Delahanty, 2013). These clinical manifestations persisted in quarantined healthcare professionals three years after the SARS outbreak (Wu et al., 2008; Reynolds et al., 2008), increasing the risk of a worsening of physical

OPEN ACCESS

Citation: Conversano, C., Marchi, L., Miniati, M. (2020). Psychological distress among healthcare professionals involved in the Covid-19 emergency: vulnerability and resilience factors. *Clinical Neuropsychiatry*, 17 (2), 94-96.

<https://doi.org/10.36131/CN20200212>

Copyright: © Clinical Neuropsychiatry
 This is an open access article. Distribution and reproduction are permitted in any medium, provided the original author(s) and source are credited.

Funding: None.

Competing interests: None.

Corresponding author

Ciro Conversano
 Via Savi n°10, Pisa, Italy
 Phone: 050.993654
 E-mail: ciro.conversano@unipi.it

health due to the well-known correlation between acute/chronic psychological distress and a number of physical diseases (Conversano, 2019; Shao et al., 2019; Martino, Langher, Cazzato, & Vicario, 2019; Martino et al., 2019b,c; Martino, Caputo, Bellone, Quattropiani, & Vicario, 2020). However, not all subjects exposed to traumatic events tended to develop mood/anxiety signs and symptoms or PTSD (Miniati et al., 2009, 2017). Several observations pointed out on the relevance of individual and environmental/interpersonal vulnerabilities that has been classified into pre-, peri- and post-traumatic factors. Pre-traumatic vulnerability factors for healthcare professionals included female gender, low socio-economic status, traumatic events during the lifespan and pre-morbid psychopathology (Dell'Osso et al., 2011; Carmassi et al., 2016; Kessler et al., 2018). Peri-traumatic factors were more related to the type and severity of event, the number of traumatic events and the level of emotional involvement with victims (Hatfield, Carpenter, & Rapson, 2014). Post-traumatic factors were related both to context-specific vulnerability factors (such as, stressful working shifts, interpersonal distrusts, difficult communications with colleagues) (Cusano & Napoli, 2003), and to the lack of social support/supportive relationships (Brewin, Andrews, & Valentine, 2000; Ozbay Fitterling, Charney, & Southwick, 2008; Eisenberger, 2013). Nurses and medical staff who perceived a valid social/interpersonal support experienced less stress and anxiety, higher self-efficacy and a better sleep quality than professionals with interpersonal deficits (Bihlmaier & Schlarb, 2016). After all, valid social support, self-efficacy, internal locus of control (LOC) and sense of coherence (SOC) have been considered as resilience factors (Roditi, Bodas, Jaffe, Knobler, & Adini 2019; Di Giuseppe et al., 2020). SOC, namely the personal perception of the ability to manage stress using internal and external resources in order to resolve tensions and find solutions (Antonovsky, 1979, 1987), has been correlated with a good mental condition in a recent study on intensive care unit nurses (Schäfer, Becker, King, Horsch, & Michael, 2019). New variables that mediate the relationship between stress and mental health included 'mindful attention' and 'emotional intelligence': having successful emotional regulation strategies and being mindful of one's internal experience seemed to protect against stress negative responses and to promote subjective well-being. Conversely, 'moral distress' seemed to be negatively correlated with resilience (Schutte & Malouff, 2011; Wang & Kong, 2014).

Obviously, we can only speculate that all these 'protective' and 'predisposing' factors might play a role also in the COVID-19 pandemic. Thus, the sudden outbreak of COVID-19, the number of victims, the involvement of all aspects of everyday activities due to the widespread of a new virus potentially fatal and with no therapeutic options, the stigma of being 'contagious' because 'in touch with the virus', together with a lack of social support in the mid/long term phase, are all new relevant stressors.

COVID-19, and its outbreak in public health, is a traumatic experience for healthcare professionals, more than for the general population. It is reasonable to hypothesize that the emergency departments' staffs will experience more severe PTSD symptoms than those in other services. To reduce the anxiety of isolation, providing emotional support and offering prompt and authoritative operating procedures at the beginning of the outbreak of any threat to public health should be valid instruments to minimise the psychological effect on the more exposed healthcare professionals. To find

out whether different working conditions in the public hospitals might led to psychological effects on healthcare workers, we should investigate the psychological effect of COVID-19 not only on emergency department staff, but also in the high-risk ward (such as, infectious disease specialists and pulmonologists) and on staff in medium-risk wards.

References

- Antonovsky, A. (1979). *Health, stress, and coping*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Inc Pub.
- Antonovsky, A. (1987). *The Jossey-Bass social and behavioral science series and the Jossey-Bass health series. Unraveling the mystery of health: How people manage stress and stay well*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Inc Pub.
- Bihlmaier, I., & Schlarb, A. A. (2016). Self-efficacy and sleep problems. *Somnologie*, 20(4), 275-280. DOI: 10.1007/s11818-016-0085-1.
- Brewin, C. R., Andrews, B., & Valentine, J. D. (2000). Meta-analysis of risk factors for posttraumatic stress disorder in trauma-exposed adults. *Journal of consulting and clinical psychology*, 68(5), 748. DOI: 10.1037/0022-006X.68.5.748.
- Carmassi, C., Gesi, C., Corsi, M., Cremone, I. M., Bertelloni, C. A., Massimetti, E., ... & Dell'Osso, L. (2018). Exploring PTSD in emergency operators of a major University Hospital in Italy: a preliminary report on the role of gender, age, and education. *Annals of general psychiatry*, 17(1), 17. DOI: 10.1186/s12991-018-0184-4.
- Carmassi, C., Gesi, C., Simoncini, M., Favilla, L., Massimetti, G., Olivieri, M. C., ... & Dell'Osso, L. (2016). DSM-5 PTSD and posttraumatic stress spectrum in Italian emergency personnel: correlations with work and social adjustment. *Neuropsychiatric disease and treatment*, 12, 375. DOI: 10.2147/NDT.S97171.
- Conversano, C. (2019). Psychological common factors in chronic diseases. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 10, 2727. DOI: 10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02727.
- Cusano, M., & Napoli, A. (2003). *Fondamenti di psicologia dell'emergenza*. M. Giannantonio (a cura di), 327-343.
- Dell'Osso, L., Carmassi, C., Massimetti, G., Daneluzzo, E., Di Tommaso, S., & Rossi, A. (2011). Full and partial PTSD among young adult survivors 10 months after the L'Aquila 2009 earthquake: Gender differences. *Journal of affective disorders*, 131(1-3), 79-83. DOI: 10.1016/j.jad.2010.11.023.
- Di Giuseppe, M., Miniati, M., Miccoli, M., Ciacchini, R., Orrù, G., Lo Sterzo, R., Di Silvestre, A., Conversano, C. (2020). Defensive responses to stressful life events associated with cancer diagnosis. *Mediterranean Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 8(1). DOI: 10.6092/2282-1619/mjcp-2384.
- Eisenberger, N. I. (2013). An empirical review of the neural underpinnings of receiving and giving social support: implications for health. *Psychosomatic medicine*, 75(6), 545. DOI: 10.1097/PSY.0b013e31829de2e7.
- Greinacher, A., Derezza-Greeven, C., Herzog, W., & Nikendei, C. (2019). Secondary traumatization in first responders: a systematic review. *European journal of psychotraumatology*, 10(1), 1562840. DOI: 10.1080/20008198.2018.1562840.
- Hatfield, E., Carpenter, M., & Rapson, R. L. (2014). Emotional contagion as a precursor to collective emotions. *Collective emotions*, 108-122.
- Inguglia, C., & Lo Coco, A. (2013). *Resilienza e vulnerabilità psicologica nel corso dello sviluppo*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Iranmanesh, S., Tirgari, B., & Bardsiri, H. S. (2013). Post-traumatic stress disorder among paramedic and hospital emergency personnel in south-east Iran. *World journal of emergency medicine*, 4(1), 26. DOI: 10.5847/wjem.jis

- sn.1920-8642.2013.01.005.
- Kessler, R. C., Aguilar-Gaxiola, S., Alonso, J., Bromet, E. J., Gureje, O., Karam, E. G., ... & Petukhova, M. V. (2018). The associations of earlier trauma exposures and history of mental disorders with PTSD after subsequent traumas. *Molecular psychiatry*, 23(9), 1892-1899. DOI: 10.1038/mp.2017.194.
- Martino, G., Bellone, F., Langher, V., Caputo, A., Catalano, A., Quattropiani, M. C., & Morabito, N. (2019c). Alexithymia and Psychological Distress Affect Perceived Quality of Life in Patients with Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus. *Mediterranean Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 7(3). DOI: 10.6092/2282-1619/2019.7.2328.
- Martino, G., Caputo, A., Bellone, F., Quattropiani, M. C., & Vicario, C. M. (2020). Going Beyond the Visible in Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus: Defense Mechanisms and their Associations with Depression and Health-Related Quality of Life. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 11, 267. DOI: 10.3389/fpsyg.2020.00267.
- Martino, G., Catalano, A., Bellone, F., Russo, G. T., Vicario, C. M., Lasco, A., ... & Morabito, N. (2019b). As time goes by: anxiety negatively affects the perceived quality of life in patients with type 2 diabetes of long duration. *Frontiers in psychology*, 10, 1779. DOI: 10.3389/fpsyg.2019.01779.
- Martino, G., Langher, V., Cazzato, V., & Vicario, C. M. (2019a). Psychological factors as determinants of medical conditions. *Frontiers in psychology*, 10, 2502. DOI: 10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02502.
- Masten, A. S., & Reed, M. G. J. (2002). Resilience in development. *Handbook of positive psychology*, 74, 88.
- Miniati, M., Rucci, P., Benvenuti, A., Frank, E., Buttenfield, J., Giorgi, G., Cassano, G.B. (2009) Clinical characteristics and treatment outcome of depression in patients with and without a history of emotional and physical abuse. *Journal of Psychiatry Research*, 6 (44), 302-309 DOI: 10.1016/j.jpsychires.2009.09.008.
- Miniati, M., Petracca, A., Carmassi, C., Mauri, M., Fratta, S., Fui, E., Giunti, I., Gesi, C., Macchia, G., & Dell'osso, L. (2017). Risk of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder in 111 survivors the 2009 Viareggio (Italy) Rail Crash: The role of mood spectrum comorbidity. *Journal of Psychopathology*, 23, 12-18. DOI: 2-s2.0-85013912675.
- Ozbay, F., Fitterling, H., Charney, D., & Southwick, S. (2008). Social support and resilience to stress across the life span: a neurobiologic framework. *Current psychiatry reports*, 10(4), 304. DOI: 10.1007/s11920-008-0049-7.
- Pacella, M. L., Hruska, B., & Delahanty, D. L. (2013). The physical health consequences of PTSD and PTSD symptoms: a meta-analytic review. *Journal of anxiety disorders*, 27(1), 33-46. DOI: 10.1016/j.janxdis.2012.08.004.
- Reynolds, D. L., Garay, J. R., Deamond, S. L., Moran, M. K., Gold, W., & Styra, R. (2008). Understanding, compliance and psychological impact of the SARS quarantine experience. *Epidemiology & Infection*, 136(7), 997-1007. DOI: 10.1017/S0950268807009156.
- Roditi, E., Bodas, M., Jaffe, E., Knobler, H. Y., & Adini, B. (2019). Impact of stressful events on motivations, self-efficacy, and development of post-traumatic symptoms among youth volunteers in emergency medical services. *International journal of environmental research and public health*, 16(9), 1613. DOI: 10.3390/ijerph16091613.
- Rushton, C. H., Batcheller, J., Schroeder, K., & Donohue, P. (2015). Burnout and resilience among nurses practicing in high-intensity settings. *American Journal of Critical Care*, 24(5), 412-420. DOI: 10.4037/ajcc2015291.
- Schäfer, S. K., Becker, N., King, L., Horsch, A., & Michael, T. (2019). The relationship between sense of coherence and post-traumatic stress: a meta-analysis. *European Journal of Psychotraumatology*, 10(1), 1562839. DOI: 10.1080/20008198.2018.1562839.
- Schutte, N. S., & Malouff, J. M. (2011). Emotional intelligence mediates the relationship between mindfulness and subjective well-being. *Personality and Individual Differences*, 50, 1116-1119. DOI: 10.1016/j.paid.2011.01.037.
- Shao, J., Yang, H., Zhang, Q., Du, W., & Lei, H. (2019). Commonalities and differences in psychological adjustment to chronic illnesses among older adults: a comparative study based on the stress and coping paradigm. *International journal of behavioral medicine*, 26(2), 143-153. DOI: 10.1007/s12529-019-09773-8.
- Wang, Y., & Kong, F. (2014). The role of emotional intelligence in the impact of mindfulness on life satisfaction and mental distress. *Social indicators research*, 116(3), 843-852. DOI: 10.1007/s12529-019-09773-8.
- Wei, Y.L., Han, B., Liu, W., Liu, G., Huang, Y. (2004). Psychosomatic discomfort and related factors among 1,411 first-line SARS staff in Beijing. *Manual of the 7th national experimental medicine symposium of Chinese Society of Integrated Traditional Chinese and Western Medicine*. Beijing, China; July: 6-12.
- Wu, P., Fang, Y., Guan, Z., Fan, B., Kong, J., Yao, Z., ... & Hoven, C. W. (2009). The psychological impact of the SARS epidemic on hospital employees in China: exposure, risk perception, and altruistic acceptance of risk. *The Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 54(5), 302-311. DOI: 10.1177/070674370905400504.
- Wu, P., Liu, X., Fang, Y., Fan, B., Fuller, C. J., Guan, Z., ... & Litvak, I. J. (2008). Alcohol abuse/dependence symptoms among hospital employees exposed to a SARS outbreak. *Alcohol & Alcoholism*, 43(6), 706-712. DOI: 10.1093/alcalc/agn073.